Minutes of the

New Bern Historic Preservation Commission
September 14, 2015

The New Bern Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) held a regular meeting on Monday, September 14, 2015, in the second floor courtroom of City Hall, 300 Pollock Street.

Members Present: Tim Thompson, Chair; Tripp Eure, Vice-Chair; Jim Morrison; Jerry Walker; Nancy Gray; John Young

Members Excused (E)/Absent (A): David Griffith; Cherri Moyers; Renee Murphy

Staff Present: Kevin Robinson, AICP, City Planner

The meeting was opened and roll call was taken. A quorum was present.

Chair Thompson explained the HPC and the quasi-judicial hearing process. Staff swore in witnesses.

Consideration of Applications:

A. **603-605 Hancock St. (John & Lydia Briggs – Andy Bayliss/TAB Homes)** - to include infill construction of new single family home. (continued from August)

Staff Comments: Staff Robinson presented the application and gave a brief explanation of the request. This is a continuation of the hearing from last month.

Chair Thompson explained that any public comments should be directed soley at any new information presented.

Applicant Comment: Mr. Andy Bayliss presented the changes to the proposed project. He showed a footprint of the plan. The concern of the main living space and the second story have been corrected, so the second story now lines up with the main floor. The second story porch on the back of the house has been removed.

Public Comment: None.

Staff Recommendations: Staff Kevin Robinson submitted the following Historic District Guidelines as appropriate to this application:

New Construction and Additions (Residential New Construction):
Placement of Structures, page 66, guidelines 1-5; Building Scale and Proportion, page 67, guidelines 1-3; Materials, pages 68-69, guidelines 1, 4; Details, page 70, guidelines 1-5; Texture, page 71, guidelines 1-2; Form and Rhythm, page 72, guidelines 1-4

Site and Setting:
Landscaping, pages 77-80, guidelines 5,9; Fences and Garden Walls, pages 82-83, guidelines 1, 4-6; Outbuildings and Accessory Structures, page 84, guidelines 5, Driveways and Off-Street Parking, pages 87-88, guidelines 2-3,8;

Statements of Reason, based on the information contained in the application, in Staff's judgment are:

1. Primary Building is placed in a manner generally consistent with smaller lots, despite the larger size and added width of the lot.

2. The primary structure is of congruous scale and proportion with its common two-story form found throughout the district as well as on this street.

3. Garages should be located in the secondary or tertiary area. The placement of the garage, while visible from the street, is congruous in scale and proportion of the house and the street.

4. Composite materials, such as Hardi board are congruous with guidelines. The board and batten Hardie application is not common, but can be found throughout the district, and is done in a relatively small area to contribute to the texture of this contemporary house.

5. The proposed details, texture, and fenestration are congruous with design guidelines and the district.

6. No landscaping, plan has been provided. Applicant may present and substantial landscaping or hardscaping features later for subsequent approval.

7. Proposed brick wall is congruous with guidelines

8. All other Site and Setting features are congruous with design guidelines

Staff suggests the Commission approve the application for major exterior alterations at this time citing the aforementioned guidelines with the following conditions:

Lighting samples and major landscaping and hardscaping, including pools and walkways shall be approved through a Minor CoA or in conjunction with future Major CoA(s).

Fencing the primary AVC (apart from the wall) shall be approved by HPC

Roof shall be a true standing seamed, flat panel, metal roof with 16-24 inch seam distance. Sample shall be provided to Administrator prior to issuance of CoA.

Applicant Comment: Mr. Bayliss stated that he has some concerns with the roofing requirements and would prefer a more cost effective locking seam roof over a hand rolled seam.

Board Discussion: Chair Thompson stated that the 3 major issues from the last meeting for the applicant were the placement of the garage, the relationship between the house and the garage and the relationship between the front porch and second story. Mr. Walker stated the garage is in a better location and the connector between the house and garage is good too. The connector is now an enclosed breezeway and the Board agreed it was acceptable. There was a lengthy discussion on roofing options. The Board agreed that either paint or stain would be fine on the porch rail.

Motion: Commissioner Morrison moved to find the application for 603 – 605 Hancock Street not incongruous with New Bern's code of ordinance sections 15-411 to 15-429 and New Bern's Historic District Guidelines based on the following specific guidelines and findings of facts:

New Construction and Additions (Residential New Construction):
Placement of Structures, page 66, guidelines 1-5; Building Scale and Proportion, page 67, guidelines 1-3; Materials, pages 68-69, guidelines 1, 4; Details, page 70, guidelines 1-5; Texture, page 71, guidelines 1-2; Form and Rhythm, page 72, guidelines 1-4

Site and Setting:
Landscaping, pages 77-80, guidelines 5,9; Fences and Garden Walls, pages 82-83, guidelines 1, 4-6; Outbuildings and Accessory Structures, page 84, guidelines 5, Driveways and Off-Street Parking, pages 87-88, guidelines 2-3,8;

Findings of Fact:

1. Primary Building is placed in a manner generally consistent with smaller lots, despite the larger size and added width of the lot.

2. The primary structure is of congruous scale and proportion with its common two-story form found throughout the district as well as on this street.

3. Garages should be located in the secondary or tertiary area. The placement of the garage, while visible from the street, is congruous in scale and proportion of the house and the street.

4. Composite materials, such as Hardi board are congruous with guidelines. The board and batten Hardie application is not common, but can be found throughout the district, and is done in a relatively small area to contribute to the texture of this contemporary house.

5. The proposed details, texture, and fenestration are congruous with design guidelines and the district.

6. No landscaping, plan has been provided. Applicant may present and any substantial landscaping or hardscaping features later for subsequent approval.

7. Proposed brick wall is congruous with guidelines

8. All other Site and Setting features in the plan are congruous with design guidelines

With the following conditions:

Lighting samples and major landscaping and hardscaping, including pools and walkways shall be approved through a Minor CoA or in conjunction with future Major CoA(s).

Fencing the primary AVC (apart from the wall on the north) shall be approved by HPC

Roof shall be a true standing seamed, flat panel, metal roof with 16-24 inch seam distance. Sample shall be provided to Administrator prior to issuance of CoA.

Vice-Chair Eure seconded. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Motion: Commissioner Young moved to issue the COA. Commissioner Walker seconded. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

B. <u>400 S. Front St.</u> (Wachovia Securities – Cooke & Associates Construction Inc.) to include replacement windows and shutters.

Staff Comments: Staff Robinson presented the application and gave a brief explanation of the request.

Applicant Comments : Mr. Axel Smith, representative for the applicant presented the project. He is requesting replacement of cottage style windows with Vinyl window and replace the wood shutters with vinyl shutters. The shutters would be put on with clamps that will snap on, so the screws will not be visible at all. They have looked into getting cottage style windows, but they are unable to get some with the appropriate wind rating for the windzone the building is in. Staff Robinson clarified that the second floor windows are six over six. The bottom floor windows are six over nine and the applicant is proposing to replace them with six over six.

Public Comments: None

Staff Recommendations: Staff Kevin Robinson submitted the following Historic District Guidelines as appropriate to this application:

<u>New Construction and Additions:</u>
Building Materials for New Construction and Additions to Non-Contributing Buildings pages 53-54, guidelines 1,3-4

Statements of Reason, based on the information contained in the application, in Staff's judgment are:

1. The building is non-contributing and relatively new to the downtown. Synthetic materials are congruous on small portions of the building such as windows.
2. Materials should be appear to be applied in a traditional manner. Shutters should not be the screw in type.

Staff suggests the Commission approve the application for major exterior alterations at this time citing the aforementioned guidelines and with the following condition.

Shutters may be fixed, but should not be screw in.

Board Discussion: Vice Chair Eure suggested the shutters should have more traditional hinges and hardware and of equal size to the fenestration wether operable or not and the material should be solid, preferably composite. He also suggested guideline 13 from page 29 of the guidelines be considered. Commissioner Gray add guidline 3 from page 59 and Commissioner Morrison also included guideline 6 from page 28.

Motion: Vice Chair Eure moved to find the application for 400 S. Front Street not incongruous with New Bern's code of ordinance sections 15-411 to 15-429 and New Bern's Historic District Guidelines based on the following specific guidelines and findings of facts:

Exterior Changes to Historic Buildings:
Windows and Doors pages 27-29, guideline 6, 13;

New Construction and Additions:
Building Materials for New Construction and Additions to Non-Contributing Buildings pages 53-54, guidelines 1,3-4; Building Scale and Proportion page 59, guidline 3;

Statements of Reason:

1. The building is non-contributing and relatively new to the downtown. A composite material would be acceptable for both the window and shutter replacement
2. Materials should be appear to be applied in a traditional manner. Shutters should not be the screw in type.

Condition:
1. A hollow vinyl shutter would not be acceptable. Material chosen should be brought to Administration for approval.

2. A minimum window configuration needs to be a simulated true divided light, in addition to the material between the glass to make the grid that you've already indicated that also needs to be pieces on the outside of the glass to give it the correct 3 dimentional appearance.

Commissioner Morrison seconded. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Motion: Vice Chair Eure moved to issue the COA. Commissioner Walker seconded. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

C. 711 New St. (Shannon Corr) to include replacement windows.

Staff Comments: Staff Kevin Robinson introduced the application and stated the applicant would like to replace the various different windows on the house.

Applicant Comments: Mr. Shannon Corr stated that he would like to get back to the original windows, which are 2 over 2. He would also like to get rid of the shutters.

Public Comments: None.

Staff Recommendation: Staff Kevin Robinson reviewed recommendations and findings: Staff submits the following Historic District Guidelines as appropriate to this application:

> **Exterior Changes to Historic Buildings:**
> **Windows and Doors, pages 26-30, guideline 4**

Statements of Reason, based on the information contained in the application, in Staff's judgment are:

> 1. Major alterations have occurred to this property over the years, including to the windows. The register lists 6 over 6 sash window type, however these appear to have been modified to fit. It is unclear if these are original as the house also features several 2 over 2 and other configurations. The Callender House next door was likely built at the same time as identical to this. It features 2 over 2 windows throughout.
>
> 2. The proposed window materials are congruous.

Staff suggests the Commission approve the application for major exterior alterations at this time citing the aforementioned guidelines with the following condition:

> Windows shall be of a configuration that HPC finds to be the most historically accurate.

Board Discussion: There was discussion about what renovations Mr. Corr can make to the house with Administrative approval and what he will need to come back to the Commission for. Mr. Corr will be replacing the siding at the time of replacement of the windows. The window sills should be wood.

Motion: Commissioner Morrison moved to find the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for 711 New Street to be not incongruous with New Bern's code of Ordinance section 15-411 to 15-429 and New Bern's Historic District Guidelines based on the following specific guidelines and findings of fact:

> **Exterior Changes to Historic Buildings:**
> **Windows and Doors, pages 26-30, guideline 4**

Findings of Fact:

> 1. Major alterations have occurred to this property over the years, including to the windows. The register lists 6 over 6 sash window type, however these appear to have been modified to fit. It is

unclear if these are original as the house also features several 2 over 2 and other configurations. The Callender House next door was likely built at the same time as identical to this. It features 2 over 2 windows throughout.

2. The proposed window materials are congruous.

Condition: Any original sashes that are removed from this property are either donated to the Preservation Foundation or used on another rehabilitation project

Commissioner Walker seconded. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Motion: Commissioner Morrison moved to issue a COA. Vice-Chair Eure seconded. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

D. **<u>229 Change St.</u> (Barbara Thomas – GO Architecture)** to include new shed roof, landscaping and driveway in the primary AVC, new garage and sidewalks in the tertiary AVC.

Staff Comments: Staff Kevin Robinson stated that no one representing the applicant was in attendance. This application will have to come before the Board at their next regularly scheduled meeting.

Chair Thompson closed the public hearing.

General Public Comments:
Peggy Broadway – 214 Change Street: Clarified that the application for 229 Change Street would not be heard tonight unless the applicant shows up before the closing of the meeting.

Marguerita – College student taking photos asked for names of speakers and Board members for a journalism article she is doing for school.

Administrative Updates and Discussion: Staff Robinson updated the Board on recent Minor works COA's issued:
411 George Street – install a fence in the Tertiary AVC
314 Metcalf Street - install a fence in the Tertiary AVC
611 Hancock – Gates on the side replacing wood gates with wrought iron as well as gutters and down spouts.

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned.

E. Tim Thompson

Tim Thompson, Chairman

Kevin Robinson, AICP
City Planner